



Education report: Request to recapitate Panama Road School (1418)

To:	Hon Jan Tinetti, Associate Minister of Education (School Operations)		
Cc:	Hon Chris Hipkins, Minister of Education		
Date:	06 September, 2022	Priority:	Medium
Security Level:	In Confidence	METIS No:	1292046
Drafter:	Gavin Holland, Senior Adviser Network	DDI	9(2)(a)
Key Contact:	Janet Schofield, Manager Network, Auckland and Tai Tokerau	DDI	9(2)(a)
Messaging seen by Communications team:	No	Round Robin:	No

Purpose of report

The purpose of this report is to provide you with the consultation feedback regarding the proposed recapitation of Panama Road School in Mt Wellington, Auckland. We are also seeking your determination that Panama Road School ceases to be a Year 1-6 contributing school and changes to a Year 1-8 full primary school.

Summary

1. Panama Road School is a decile 1, Year 1-6 co-educational contributing primary state school located in Mt Wellington, Auckland. The Panama Road School Board has applied to change its year levels to become a full primary school offering Year 1-8.
2. Panama Road School is in the Māngere/Ōtāhuhu/Papatoetoe catchment of the National Education Network Plan (NEGP). The NEGP identifies that the Māngere/Ōtāhuhu/Papatoetoe catchment is expected to accommodate significant growth over the next two decades. Ōtāhuhu is identified as a strategic development area in the Auckland Plan 2050. The redevelopment of the railway station and transport interchange, town square, recreation centre and pool, and new housing developments will encourage an increase in population and result in pressure on school rolls in the catchment.

3. Before making a decision about the proposal for recapitation of Panama Road School, consultation must be undertaken with the Board of the school concerned and with the boards of state schools whose rolls might be affected. The Ministry conducted this consultation, after approval from Minister Hipkins to do so [METIS 1261172 refers].
4. Twenty-nine schools were consulted. Two responses were received: from Ōtāhuhu College and Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School. While Ōtāhuhu College support the proposed change, Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School strongly oppose it. The Intermediate School consider they provide a wider range of learning opportunities for intermediate aged students than the primary school can offer.
5. The current educational pathway for students from Panama Road School is through to Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School and then to Ōtāhuhu College.
6. The whānau from Panama Road School believe that the move from Year 6 to an intermediate school is particularly challenging for their students and families. They consider that retaining them in the primary school environment for an additional two years, will allow time for the students to become more confident and ready to transition from Panama Road School to secondary school.
7. The proposed change would see approximately 20 students retained at Panama Road School (1 July 2022 roll was 244) and these students would not transition to Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School (1 July 2022 roll was 342).
8. Any decline in the roll at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School would be short term, as the school sits within a high growth catchment. The Ministry is already providing additional staffing at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School as it is in an area of housing redevelopment. As homes are demolished, rolls have declined and as the more intensive housing is completed and families move in, rolls will grow. We are supporting many schools in this situation with additional staffing to maintain staffing levels.
9. Panama Road School is invested in supporting its vulnerable students and wider community. They firmly believe their students would build a stronger foundation with two additional years at Panama Road School and gain the necessary confidence to transition successfully to secondary schooling.
10. If this application is approved, families from the Panama Road School area would still have a choice of schooling between the full primary school or Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School.
11. The staff at Panama Road School consider they have built and value relationships with students, whānau and the wider community, which will enable students to make greater progress in their learning as a result of these bonds between teaching staff and students.
12. The Board has proposed a phased implementation of Year 7 being introduced in 2023 and Year 8 in 2024. Staff throughout all levels of the school have recent experience in teaching Year 7 and 8 students, including bilingual Māori medium provision.
13. If this application is approved, no additional property would be required, as Panama Road School currently has five surplus teaching spaces which the Board will look to repurpose.

Recommended actions

We recommend that you:

- a) **note** the application from the Panama Road School Board to recapitate their school from a Year 1-6 contributing school to a Year 1-8 full primary school;
- b) **agree** that Panama Road School will cease to be a contributing school and will recapitate from a Year 1-6 contributing school to a Year 1-8 full primary school, under section 194(1) of the Education and Training Act 2020, with effect from Term one, 2023; and

☒ Agree / ☐ Disagree

- c) **agree** that this change be phased in, under section 194(7) of the Education and Training Act 2020, with the school providing Year 7 in 2023 and Year 8 in 2024.

☒ Agree / ☐ Disagree

If you agree, you are asked to:

- d) **sign** the attached letter to the presiding member of the Board giving effect to your decision and to the local Members of Parliament informing them of your decision.

We also recommend that you:

- e) **agree** that this report will be proactively released in line with your expectations. Any information that might need to be withheld will be done so in line with the provisions of the Official Information Act 1982.

☒ Agree / ☐ Disagree



Isabel Evans
Hautū | Deputy Secretary
Te Mahau | Te Tai Raro

06/09/2022



Hon Jan Tinetti
Associate Minister of Education
(School Operations)

10/09/2022

Background

1. Panama Road School is a co-educational contributing primary school, located in Mt Wellington, Auckland. The school is part of the Ōtāhuhu Kāhui Ako. The Board has applied to change its year levels from Year 1-6 to Year 1-8 full primary school. (Application attached as Annex 2).

Accessibility to Intermediate schooling

2. The application noted that its school whānau believe the move from Year 6 to intermediate school is a particularly challenging transition for its students and their families.
3. The community find accessibility to the intermediate school is difficult due to its separation from the Panama Road area by the southern motorway. The resulting transport required to access the intermediate school adds to financial costs for larger families in this area.
4. It has been noted that when a child is ready for intermediate schooling, some families choose to unenroll all siblings from Panama Road School and transfer to a full primary school or another intermediate school more convenient to their family's needs.
5. The application included community surveys showing 66.7% moved their younger children to a new school when the oldest moved to intermediate due to accessibility, and travel costs. Of the respondents, 70.8% also said they would have liked to keep their children together at Panama Road School if there was Year 7-8 provision.

Panama Road School

6. Panama Road School reports that two thirds of their students in 2020, chose to leave the Ōtāhuhu Kāhui Ako in favour of either other full primaries in the Mt Wellington area or an intermediate school further afield. By providing education for this community up to Year 8, it is believed that students will remain within the Ōtāhuhu Kāhui Ako and will successfully transition to continue their learning at Year 9.

Network considerations

7. Panama Road School is part of the Māngere/Ōtāhuhu/Papatoetoe catchment of the National Education Growth Plan (NEGP). This catchment is expected to accommodate significant growth over the next two decades including large scale public housing projects and private sector development, that will deliver a further 10,000 homes in the overall catchment.
8. Panama Road School is part of the Ōtāhuhu sub-catchment of this network and part of the Ōtāhuhu Māngere Resource Teacher for Learning and Behaviour (RTLb) cluster. Ōtāhuhu is identified as a strategic growth area in the Auckland Unitary Plan.
9. Ōtāhuhu itself is fairly small and contained, with industrial areas to the north and the south. It is a relatively constrained catchment due to being positioned on a narrow strip of land with boundaries due to the main southern railway, industrial land, and the southern motorway.
10. Panama Road School is located in the northeast of the Māngere/Ōtāhuhu/Papatoetoe catchment and is 2.5km from the nearest intermediate school, Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School.

11. All the other primary schools in Mt Wellington cater up to Year 8, including Sylvia Park School, Bailey Road School, Stanhope Road School, Panmure District School and Ellerslie School. These schools are part of the Maungakiekie Community of Learning. Many of the Panama Road School families prefer the full primary option and choose to send their children to one of these schools to allow all their siblings to remain together at one school.
12. Three primary schools within the Ōtāhuhu network are Year 1-6 and feed into Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School. At present, the rolls of the primary schools within the network are stable.

If this application is approved

13. As approximately 70% of parents indicated they would like to keep their children at Panama Road School, this would lead to the retention of approximately 20 Year 7 students and a combined Year 7 and 8 cohort of approximately 40 students.
14. Panama Road School is part of the Ōtāhuhu Kāhui Ako. The other schools in this Kāhui Ako are listed in the table below. Fairburn School (Year 1-6) is also within this network of schools however they are not part of the Kāhui Ako. The current expected educational pathway for students from Panama Road School is through to Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School and then to Ōtāhuhu College.

School ID	School Name	School Type
1379	Mt Richmond School	Specialist School
88	Ōtāhuhu College	Secondary (Year 9-15)
1408	Ōtāhuhu Intermediate	Intermediate
1409	Ōtāhuhu School	Contributing
874	Pacific Advance Secondary School	Secondary (Year 9-15)
1418	Panama Road School	Contributing

Consultation

15. We consulted with 29 schools. Two responses were received during the consultation period: from Ōtāhuhu College and Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School. Full copies of these letters are attached as Annex 3, with summaries provided below.

School	Response
Ōtāhuhu College	Provided their support for the change at Panama Road School. They indicated that the Panama Road Community would be best served by the recapitulation of Years 7 and 8 at Panama Road School.

Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School	Strongly opposed the recapitation of Panama Road School. They raised the point that an Intermediate school is able to provide a wider range of learning opportunities and technology experiences than what may be offered at a full primary school.
-----------------------------	---

Ministry response

16. We acknowledge that intermediate schools specialise in providing education for Year 7-8 students and agree that where rolls and staffing allow, they are able to offer a wide range of subjects and learning opportunities for their students.
17. In recent years Panama Road School has been active in upskilling their staff to have the capability to deliver education to Year 7 and 8 students. They are actively forming relationships with local schools, so that if this application is approved, they can ensure they can also provide a wide range of learning opportunities. This would include a full programme of technology that meets the standards of the New Zealand Curriculum.

Education considerations

18. Panama Road School is currently developing and strengthening teaching staff in Te Reo Māori, and Tikanga Māori. They proposed that this will impact positively on teaching, leadership, and learner support, which would enhance the Year 7 and Year 8 programmes.
19. Continuing Years 7 and 8 at Panama Road School will ensure Māori and Pacific culture continues to be embedded in the local curriculum.
20. If this application is approved, relationships would be utilised within the Kāhui Ako to deliver the technology curriculum and the school would collaborate with Te Kaha ō te Rangatahi for sexuality and gender education. Panama Road School already has the facilities to teach food technology. Ōtāhuhu Primary School has agreed to let the students use their facilities to teach the other aspects of the technology curriculum. In addition, the school has approached the local secondary school who have indicated that the students would also be able to use their technology facilities.
21. The Tāmaki sports cluster consists of other Mt Wellington schools which are all full primary (Sylvia Park School, Bailey Road School, Stanhope Road School, Stonefields School and Panmure District School). Panama Road School have started discussions with some of the schools within the Tāmaki cluster, regarding their Year 7 and 8 students having regular participation in competitive and non-competitive sports with those schools.
22. The application highlights that staff throughout all levels of Panama Road School have recent experience in teaching Year 7 and 8 students, including bilingual Māori. In anticipation, this year, the school released an experienced teacher, to establish the Year 7 programme for next year.
23. Staff are working collaboratively with other schools in the Ōtāhuhu Kāhui Ako, which would support any wider changes that would need to be made if the recapitation of the school was approved.

24. The 2019 ERO report states that –

Greater consistency in teaching, learning and assessment processes is beginning to enable leaders and teachers to analyse and make better use of achievement data. School data for the last 18 months show that the majority of learners are achieving at the expected curriculum level in reading, writing and mathematics.

Learners achieve well in relation to other school valued outcomes. They generally have a strong sense of identity and culture, show pride and belonging in their school, and are confident and collaborate with each other.

Leaders and teachers are focused on continuing to increase student attendance and whānau engagement. These initiatives have been a factor in improved achievement and more positive trajectories for learners whose learning and achievement are at risk.

On the basis of the findings of this review, ERO's overall evaluation judgement of Panama Road School's performance in achieving valued outcomes for its students is: well placed.

Staffing

25. Panama Road School has estimated a retention of approximately 20 students in their first year of recapitation. This would generate one extra teaching entitlement. A total roll of 40 students would lead to one further teaching requirement.
26. The drop in staffing at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School is expected to be offset through growth in the local student population in line with the projections for this catchment.
27. As Ōtāhuhu is experiencing housing redevelopment, many homes are being demolished and more intensive housing is being built. This has seen the roll at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School dip (as housing is demolished and families move from the area), but it will increase as the new homes attract families with school aged children.
28. Over the last three years we have supported schools in this situation with special reasons staffing. Panama Road School is not affected, but we continue to support Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School with additional staffing during the transition.

Financial implications

29. If the change is approved, the total additional operational cost to the Crown (including resourcing and staffing) is estimated to be \$315,894 per annum (GST inclusive) in the first year. This does not include costs associated with surplus staffing that could occur as a result of this change.

School financial viability

30. The financial position at Panama Road School has strengthened considerably over 2019 and 2020. The board reported a surplus of \$285,487 in 2020 strengthening working capital to \$499,216. The financial position is very sound for a small school. The current portion of the cyclical maintenance provision is \$90,046.

31. Panama Road School has estimated that they would likely retain an additional 20 students in year 7 in their first year of recapitation. These students would generate an additional operation grant funding of \$18,433.40 plus GST and extra teacher entitlement.

Property implications

32. Panama Road School currently has five surplus teaching spaces and the capacity to cater for the additional students without any additional property being required. The Board would look to repurpose these spaces as required.

Transport implications

33. There are no transport implications if you determine that the school ceases to be a contributing school. The school does not receive any school transport funding at this time due to its location, with access to suitable public transport options.
34. We do note that where schools are not able to offer technology classes, the Ministry may provide school buses to transport students to and from the closest technology provider where classes are offered.

Assessment

35. The NEGP identifies the Māngere/Ōtāhuhu/Papatoetoe catchment as an area expected to accommodate significant growth over the next two decades.
36. Given this is an area of population growth, it is likely that any decline in the roll at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School would be short term. We will continue to monitor its roll and support it with special reasons staffing as its roll is impacted by housing redevelopments.
37. The Board has suggested a phased implementation with Year 7 being retained at Panama Road School in 2023 and Year 8 starting in 2024. Panama Road School has surveyed its current Year 6 cohort and estimate that they would retain 20 students in Year 7.
38. If Panama Road School retained 20 Year 7 students, this could lead to approximately 40 Year 7 and 8 students in 2024. The staggered increase would transition the impact over two years.
39. Panama Road School has been planning and preparing for the implementation of teaching at Years 7 and 8 for some time. They have been developing and strengthening teaching staff in Te Reo Māori, and Tikanga Māori. This would impact positively on teaching, leadership, and learner support, which would enhance the Year 7 and 8 programmes. They have engaged with other schools in planning for their Year 7 and 8 technology and sports curriculums.
40. Panama Road School has five spare classrooms on site, with two of those are being utilised as a library and a community room. If this application is approved, we will work with the Board to repurpose its property for the senior students.
41. The financial position at Panama Road School is very sound for a small school. The current portion of the cyclical maintenance provision is \$90,046.

Risks and mitigations

42. There would be a short-term decline in the roll at Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School if Panama Road School were to retain students at Year 7 and 8. The impact of this may not be significant if some students still chose the intermediate option. Furthermore, this area has been identified as an area of growth so the impacts may only be short term. We have been and will continue to support Ōtāhuhu Intermediate School with additional staffing, which is what we are doing for many Auckland schools that are affected by housing redevelopments.

Next steps

43. After considering the information in this report, if you are satisfied the school should cease to be a contributing primary school and recapitate to become Year 1-8 full primary school, a draft letter (Annex 1) is attached for you to inform the presiding member of the Board, and to give effect to your decision.
44. You are asked to return the signed letter for the presiding member to the Ministry, so it can be delivered by Ministry staff.

Proactive release

45. This report will be proactively released in line with your expectations. Any information that might need to be withheld will be done so in line with the provisions of the Official Information Act 1982.

Annexes

Annex 1: Letter to presiding member and local Members of Parliament

Annex 2: Application for recapitation

Annex 3: Feedback letters from the consultation process

Annex 1: Letter to presiding member and local Members of Parliament

Hon Jan Tinetti

Minister of Internal Affairs
Minister for Women
Associate Minister of Education



Tomisiana Haitoua
Presiding Member
Panama Road School Board
139 Panama Road
Mount Wellington
Auckland

Tēnā koe Tomisiana

Thank you for your application proposing that I change Panama Road School from a Year 1-6 contributing primary school to a Year 1-8 full primary school.

I have considered the details of your application and the feedback from the consultation that has been undertaken with the schools whose rolls might be affected.

Under section 194(1) of the Education and Training Act 2020 (the Act), I have decided that Panama Road School shall become a Year 1-8 full primary school effective from Term 1 2023.

Under section 197(7), I have decided that the recapitation of Panama Road School will be phased in one year level at a time, with Year 7 in 2023 and Year 8 in 2024.

If you have comments or questions about this process, please contact Gavin Holland in the Ministry's Auckland office by email on 9(2)(a) [REDACTED] Gavin will be in touch with you about implementing this change.

Nāku noa, nā

Hon Jan Tinetti
Associate Minister of Education (School Operations)

Hon Jan Tinetti

Minister of Internal Affairs
Minister for Women
Associate Minister of Education



Hon Peeni Henare
Parliament Buildings
Wellington

Tēnā koe Peeni

I have received an application from the Panama Road School Board proposing that I change the school from a Year 1-6 contributing primary to a Year 1-8 full primary school.

I have taken time to consider the Board's application and the consultation feedback.

Under section 194(1) of the Education and Training Act 2020, I have decided that Panama Road School will be a Year 1-8 full primary school from 1 January 2023.

Nāku noa, nā

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Tinetti'.

Hon Jan Tinetti
Associate Minister of Education (School Operations)

Hon Jan Tinetti

Minister of Internal Affairs
Minister for Women
Associate Minister of Education



Hon Jenny Salesa
Parliament Buildings
Wellington

Tēnā koe Jenny

I have received an application from the Panama Road School Board proposing that I change the school from a Year 1-6 contributing primary to a Year 1-8 full primary school.

I have taken time to consider the Board's application and the consultation feedback.

Under section 194(1) of the Education and Training Act 2020, I have decided that Panama Road School will be a Year 1-8 full primary school from 1 January 2023.

Nāku noa, nā

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Tinetti'.

Hon Jan Tinetti
Associate Minister of Education (School Operations)

Proactively Released

Proactively Released