





Thank you for your email of 31 October 2017 to the Ministry of Education requesting the following information under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act):

"I would like to request all written communication, including emails and meeting minutes, and notes, between the Ministry of Education and Victoria University of Wellington that includes but is not limited to the sale of the Karori Campus, the Ministry's negotiations and offers to buy land at the site, and the proposal of a technology hub, dating back to September 2016."

On 9 November 2016, we contacted you advising you identifying all emails for this period may not be possible. Your request was then refined to:

 "All correspondence, meeting minutes, and notes between the Ministry of Education and Victoria University of Wellington regarding the sale of Karori Campus and development of a technology hub since December 2016."

We have included and overview of the various property transfers, negotiations and decisions surrounding Victoria University of Wellington (VUW) below.

Transfer of Crown assets to Victoria University of Wellington

The Crown Asset Transfer and Disposal Policy for Crown-owned assets managed by Tertiary Education Institutions (TEIs) was established by Cabinet in March 2010. The policy allows TEIs to obtain legal ownership of Crown assets that are core to their educational purposes and to dispose of those which are surplus to requirements.

The intention of the policy is to provide a clear framework for ownership and control of Crown title assets and to encourage TEIs to manage these assets in an efficient manner.

In September 2010, Victoria University Wellington (VUW) applied to the Tertiary Education Commission for transfer of Crown assets under its management at the Karori campus site.

VUW agreed a memorandum of understanding for the transfer process with the Secretary for Education in April 2012. The transfer was then completed over three tranches, from December 2014 to December 2015. Each of the three transfer tranches were documented in agreements under Section 50 of the Public Works Act 1981 (PWA), with a nominal consideration of \$10 paid by VUW per tranche.

The Sale and Purchase of Real Estate agreement covering the campus was signed on 16 March 2015. The Gazette Notice was then issued on 2 April 2015 and the Land Transfer Register was updated on 8 April 2015.

Disposal of surplus assets

On 30 August 2016, VUW notified the Ministry of its decision to declare the Karori campus surplus to requirements with immediate effect. The Ministry met with VUW to discuss the request, and raised its interest in some of the campus land including the sites occupied by Karori Kids and Campbell Kindergarten (the ECEs).

On 2 December 2016, the Secretary for Education granted consent for VUW to dispose of its Karori campus properties. This was subject to VUW's compliance with PWA requirements and the conditions specified as part of the initial transfer to VUW ownership.

VUW was also advised the Ministry was reviewing its educational capacity needs for the area, and it did not expect to be able to confirm its PWA requirements until early 2017.

Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids

Discussion between the Ministry and VUW has been ongoing from early 2017. Our first focus was ensuring the ECEs remain on their current sites.

Given the nominal sum paid by VUW to gain ownership of these sites, the Ministry considered transferring the sites back to Ministry ownership should also be at nominal cost. Negotiations over the transfer value progressed through to July 2017, when the Ministry agreed to compromise on the amount to be paid to VUW.

The sale and purchase agreement for the ECE sites was finalised in August 2017, at a value of \$931,500. The Ministry will become the future landlord of the ECEs and they will continue to operate as they currently do.

Main Karori Campus site

The Ministry also explored the educational requirement for the main campus site. Options including providing additional land for surrounding schools and a potential technology hub were considered and we began negotiations with VUW on a parcel on land.

Negotiations between the Ministry and VUW have now concluded and unfortunately our offer was substantially less than some of the other offers received through the open market sale process VUW initiated on 7 August 2017.

We are satisfied that Public Works Act 1981 requirements have been met and have advised Land Information New Zealand (LINZ) accordingly.

We know that this decision will be disappointing for some in the Karori community but we have worked hard to secure the land for a technology hub and are obliged to consider value for money for the taxpayer. As we stated in March 2017, we could only buy the land if we could get it at the right price.

We will now investigate other options to meet technology provision for Wellington schools.

We have identified **110** documents in scope of your request. A table summarising our decision on their release is attached as **Appendix A**.

Please note, we have done our best to identify all emails between Ministry staff and VUW for the time period you have requested. Due to the complex nature of the various negotiations and processes related to the Karori Campus, a large number of staff across the Ministry have been involved. Our search has primarily focused on staff from Tier 3 and above, unless responsibilities on a particular issue were delegated to a specific staff member from Tier 4 and below.

Please note, the Ministry now proactively publishes OIA responses on our website. As such we may publish this response on our website after five working days. Your name and contact details will be removed.

Thank you again for your email. If you have further questions please feel free to contact our media team in the first instance at media.team@education.govt.nz.

If you are unsatisfied with my response, you have the right to ask an Ombudsman to review it. You can do this by writing to info@ombudsman.parliament.nz or Office of the Ombudsman, PO Box 10152, Wellington 6143.

Yours sincerely

Rob Giller

Acting Head of Education Infrastructure Service





APPENDIX A

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
1.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Professor Guilford - Victoria University of Wellington (VUW) - Transfer of Crown Assets - Variation to terms of the Memorandum of Understanding	9/07/2015	Release in full
2.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Katrina Casey - VUW - Disposal of Karori Campus	30/08/2016	Release in full
3.	Letter from Claire Douglas to Professor Guilford - Update on Disposal process	15/09/2016	Release in full
4.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Roger Smyth - Victoria University of Wellington – Disposal of Karori Campus	22/09/2016	Release in full
5.	Email from Kim Shannon to Professor Guilford and Mark Loveard - Request to dispose of surplus assets at Karori campus	1/12/2016	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
6.	Letter from Katrina Casey (Acting Secretary of Education) to Professor Guilford - Application to dispose of surplus assets at Karori Campus	2/12/2016	Release in full
7.	Emails between Ministry of Education and VUW regarding correspondence	2/12/16 - 5/12/2016	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
8.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Iona Holsted - Karori Campus	9/12/2016	Release in full
9.	Email from Mark Loveard to Suze Strowger - Response to 2 December Letter	9/12/2016	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
10.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Suze Strowger - Karori Campus	9/12/2016	Release in full
11.	Emails between Claire Douglas and Professor Guilford - Commercial in Confidence	13/12/16 - 14/12/2016	Release in full
12.	Email from Simon Johnson to Valarie Bland - Meeting	15/12/2016	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
13.	Emails between Professor Guilford and the Ministry of Education - Fwd: Ministry of Education correspondence: Karori Campus	15/12/2016 - 19/12/2016	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
14.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Ministry of Education - Re: Ministry of Education Correspondence: Karori Campus	15/12/16 - 5/01/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
15.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Suze Strowger - Victoria University of Wellington – Disposal of Karori Campus	21/12/2016	Release in full
16.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Grant Guilford - RE: Karori ECEs	3/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
17.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Grant Guilford - ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	7/02/2017	Release in full
18.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Kim Shannon - ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	8/02/2017	Release in full
19.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Grant Guilford - RE: Karori Campus statement FYI	8/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
20.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Grant Guilford - RE: Karori Campus statement FYI	8/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
21.	Emails between Kim Shannon, Katherine Edmond and Grant Guilford -Victoria University statement on Karori	8/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
22.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Grant Guilford - ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	20/02/2017	Release in full
23.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Grant Guilford - RE: ECE Properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	21/02/2017 - 2/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
24.	Email from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - ECE Properties & Transfer Process	23/02/2017	Release in full
25.	(attachment) Ltr to K Shannon MoE	23/02/2017	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
26.	(attachment) FINAL_170222_WCE properties_Updated	23/02/2017	Withheld in full. Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(h) of the Act
27.	(attachment) Bayleys Valuation Certificate - 25 Campbell Street	22/02/2017	Withheld in full. Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(h) of the Act
28.	(attachment) Bayleys Valuation Certificate - 29 Campbell Street	22/02/2017	Withheld in full. Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(h) of the Act
29.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Grant Guilford - ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	27/02/2017	Release in full
30.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Grant Guilford - Karori ECEs	27/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
31.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Grant Guilford - ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	7/03/2017	Release in full
32.	(attach) Letter to Kim Shannon from KPMG (10177981_1)	7/03/2017	Release in full
33.	Emails between Grant Guilford and Kim Shannon - RE: ECE properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	7/03/2017 - 8/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
34.	Letter to Grant Guilford from Kim Shannon - Official Declaration of Interest	15/02/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act
35.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - ECE properties at former Karori Campus (1009723)	17/02/2017	Release in full
36.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Kim Shannon - MoE Public Work Requirement	21/03/2017	Release in full
37.	(attachment) Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - Expression of interest - Karori Campus (170321)	20/03/2017	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
38.	Emails between PWC, VUW and the Ministry – Re: FW: VUW Karori Campus	22/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
39.	Letter from Clive Huggins to Mark Loveard - Intent to Acquire land at VUWs Karori Campus	24/03/2017	Release in full
40.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Clive Huggins - Re VUW Karori Campus	24/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
41.	Letter from Grant Guilford to Minister of Finance - Rebate of 20% of Property Disposal Proceeds	28/03/2017	Release in full
42.	Emails between Denise Young and Clive Huggins - FW: Karori Campus. Meeting Friday 31 March 9am	29/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
43.	(attachment) Hunter Building_HU209, HU210, HU211	29/03/2017	Release in full
44.	Emails between Jerry Ball and Clive Huggins - Karori campus: transfer of ECE properties	29/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
45.	(attachment) Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - ECE properties at former Karori Campus (1009723) DOCUMENT 35	17/03/2017	Release in full
46.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Professor Guilford - ECE Properties - Campbell Kindergarten and Karori Kids	30/03/2017	Release in full
47.	Emails between Clive Huggins and Jerry Ball - Re: Karori campus: transfer of ECE properties	30/03/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
48.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Professor Guilford - RE: ECE Properties - Karori	31/03/17 - 3/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
49.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Grant Guilford - Campbell Kindergarten - Section 40 Offer Back	6/04/2017	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
50.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Rob Giller - RE: Karori ECE boundary issues	10/04/2017 - 11/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
51.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Rob Giller - FW: Karori - URGENT	12/04/2017	Release in part . Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
52.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Rob Giller - FW: Karori - URGENT	12/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
53.	Emails between Ministry staff and Mark Loveard - FW: Campbell Kindergarten - Section 40 Offer Back	13/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
54.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - Campbell Kindergarten - Section 40 Offer Back	12/04/2017	Release in full
55.	Emails between PWC and the Ministry - FW: Victoria University and MOE - 25 Campbell Street, Karori (Campbell Kindergarten)	13/04/2017 - 15/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
56.	(attachment) 25 Campbell Street boundary plan 11.04.17	15/04/2017	Release in full
57.	Emails between Greenwood Roche, VUW and the Ministry - RE: Karori ECE Centres - Potential Meeting	10/04/2017 - 19/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
58.	Emails between Mark Loveard, Kim Shannon and Rob Giller - RE: Karori - URGENT	12/04/2017 - 28/04/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
59.	Emails between Rob Giller and Mark Loveard - RE: ECE + Alternative Use Letters	5/05/2017 - 8/05/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
60.	(attachment) Letter from PWC to The Property Group Ltd	8/05/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
61.	(attachment) Letter from Mark Loveard to Rob Giller - Karori ECEs- next steps	5/05/2017	Release in full
62.	Emails between Rob Giller and Mark Loveard - RE: ECE Properties & Transfer Process	23/02/2017 - 10/05/2017	Release in full
63.	Emails between Rob Giller, Kim Shannon and Mark Loveard - RE: ECE Properties & Transfer Process	23/02/2017 - 11/05/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
64.	Emails between Stephen Costley and Rob Giller - Fwd: Karori Campus - 25 and 29 Campbell Street	18/05/2017 - 26/05/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
65.	Emails between Stephen Costley, Mark Loveard and Rob Giller FW: Karori Campus - 25 and 29 Campbell Street	18/05/2017 - 1/06/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
66.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Ministry staff - Fwd: Phone call with Iona Holsted	02/06/2017 - 23/06/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
67.	(attachment) Key dates Karori divestment	23/06/2017	Release in full
68.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Hon Paul Goldsmith	23/06/2017	Release in full
69.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Rob Giller - ECEs on the Karori Campus	10/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
70.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Rob Giller - Re: ECE's on the Karori Campus Without Prejudice	10/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
71.	(attachment) [img-710160451-00011] Valuation certificate 25 Campbell Street	10/07/2017	Withheld in full. Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(h) of the Act
72.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Minister Kaye - Karori Campus - Early Childhood Education Centres (ECEs)	11/07/2017	Release in full
73.	Emails between Jerry Ball and Rob Giller - Re: Karori - Sale and purchase agreement for 25 & 29 Campbell Street	11/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
74.	Emails between Jerry Ball and Rob Giller - Re: Karori - Sale and purchase agreement for 25 & 29 Campbell Street	11/07/2017 - 12/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act • 9(2)(h) of the Act
75.	Emails between Jerry Ball and Rob Giller - Re: Karori - Sale and purchase agreement for 25 & 29 Campbell Street	13/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
76.	Emails between Jerry Ball and Rob Giller - Re: Karori - Sale and purchase agreement for 25 & 29 Campbell Street	12/07/2017 - 13/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
77.	(attachment) Letter to Minister Kaye from Professor Guilford - Karori main campus	13/07/2017	Release in full
78.	Emails between Jerry Ball, Clive Huggins and Rob Giller - Re: Karori - Sale and purchase agreement for 25 & 29 Campbell Street	12/07/2017 - 18/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
79.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Professor Guilford	2/07/2017	Release in full
80.	Letter from Professor Guilford to Kim Shannon	26/07/2017	Release in full
81.	Emails between Kim Shannon and Professor Guilford - RE: Victoria University's Karori Campus	28/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
82.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Professor Guilford - Victoria University's Karori Campus	28/07/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act
83.	Email from Stephen Costley - Karori Campus Update	2/08/2017	Release in full
84.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - Karori Campus	2/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
85.	Letter from Kim Shannon to Mark Loveard	3/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act
86.	Letter from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon	4/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act
87.	Email from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon - Karori Campus	7/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
88.	Emails between Mark Loveard and Rob Giller - Re: Karori Campus	7/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
89.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Kim Shannon - RE: Joint Press Release	9/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
90.	Emails between Professor Guilford and Kim Shannon - Re: Joint Press Release	9/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
91.	Emails between Ruth Berry and Katherine Edmond - Legal advice	10/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
92.	Emails between Rob Giller, Mark Loveard and Jerry Ball - Re: ECE contracts	10/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
93.	Emails between Iona Holsted and Professor Guilford - FW: Final Draft media statement	11/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
94.	(attachment) Media Statement from Victoria University and Ministry of Education	11/08/2017	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
95.	Emails between Rob Giller, Kim Shannon, Mark Loveard and PWC - RE: Options for Tech Hub at Karori	10/08/2017 - 11/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
96.	Emails between VUW and WCC - RE: Karori Campus Meeting	17/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
97.	Emails between Vicki Faint and Rob Giller - RE: Karori Campus Meeting	17/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
98.	Emails between PWC, Rob Giller and Mark Loveard - RE: Options for Tech Hub at Karori	10/08/2017 - 18/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
99.	Emails between PWC, Rob Giller and Mark Loveard - Sale of the former Karori Campus in Karori, Wellington	21/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
100.	(attachment) Victoria University Karori Campus Sale Return On Investment	21/08/2017	Release in full
101.	Email from Vicki Faint to Suze Strowger: Karori Update 1 September 2017	1/09/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
102.	Emails between Rob Giller, PWC and Professor Guilford - RE: Sale of the former Karori Campus in Karori, Wellington	10/08/2017 - 4/09/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
103.	Email from Professor Guilford to Iona Holsted - Fwd: Divestment of Karori Campus	29/09/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
104.	Email from Mark Loveard to Kim Shannon and Rob Giller - Karori Update	29/09/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
105.	Letter from Iona Holsted to Professor Guilford	2/10/2017	Release in full

	Document Description	Date	Decision on release
106.	Email to Iona Holsted from Professor Guilford - Fwd: Karori Campus	3/10/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act
107.	(attachment) Letter from Iona Holsted to Professor Guilford (document 104)	2/10/2017	Release in full
108.	(attachment) Letter from Professor Guilford to Kim Shannon	4/08/2017	Release in part Information withheld under section/s: • 9(2)(a) of the Act • 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act • 9(2)(j) of the Act
109.	Letter from Iona Holsted to Professor Grant Guilford	4/10/2017	Release in full
110.	(attachment) Media Statement from Victoria University and Ministry of Education	11/08/2017	Release in full